Asociación de Psicología de Puerto Rico

PO Box 363435 San Juan, Puerto Rico 00936-3435
Tel. 787.751.7100  Fax 787.758.6467
www.asppr.net  E-mail: info@asppr.net

Revista Puertorriqueña de Psicología
Volumen 8, 1992
Culture and Attachment

Abstract

This investigation used the procedure developed by Harwood (1992) with Anglo and migrant Puerto Rican mothers to examine cultural differences in indigenous concepts of desirable and undesirable attachment behavior among 27 middle- and lower-class Puerto Rican mothers living on the island. Of particular interest was: (a) whether similar cultural differences would be obtained using Puerto Rican mothers from the island as were obtained using migrant mothers living on the mainland United States (Harwood, 1992; Harwood & Miller, 1991), and (b) to what extent these cross-cultural findings would be true of middle-class as well as of the lower-class Puerto Rican mothers sampled previously. The results indicate that, although socioeconomic effects exist, both middle- and lower-class Puerto Rican mothers living in Puerto Rico place more emphasis than do Anglo mothers on the child's ability to maintain proper demeanor in a public context, and less emphasis on the maximization of self as an autonomous unit. Moreover, cultural group membership was consistently the single largest predictor of significant variance in the regression analy-
ses, suggesting the presence of core cultural values which obtain across socioeconomic status.

Anglo and Puerto Rican Mothers' Perceptions of Attachment:

Preliminary Findings from the Island

In the past few years, several cross-cultural attachment researchers have suggested that, although a universal repertoire of attachment behaviors may exist among infants across cultures, the selection, shaping, and interpretation of these behaviors over time appears to be culturally patterned (Grossmann & Grossmann, 1990; Hinde, 1982; Hinde & Stevenson-Hinde, 1990; Sagl, 1990; Takahashi, 1990; van IJzendoom, 1990). Although these researchers provide ample evidence of cultural differences in Strange Situation behavior and speculate regarding the ways in which cultural values may influence attachment, few studies have directly examined the relationship between cultural values and Strange Situation behavior (see Harwood, 1992; Harwood & Miller, 1991). Given the power of attachment as both a theoretical framework for understanding early socioemotional development ( Bowlby, 1969) and a clinical tool for predicting later childhood social competence (Belsky & Nezworski, 1988), the continued exploration of its cross-cultural significance remains paramount. Only through such an undertaking can we better understand the ways in which attachment is both universal and culturally shaped, and only through such an undertaking can we properly evaluate attachment's usefulness as a diagnostic tool.

Harwood (1992) examined indigenous concepts of desirable and undesirable attachment behavior among middle — and lower — class Anglo and lower — class migrant Puerto Rican mothers in order to identify shared codes of meaning which may underlie cultural differences in perceptions of normative attachment behavior. In part 1 of this study, indigenous concepts of desirable and undesirable attachment behavior were elicited using open-ended probes. On the basis of mothers' responses in Study 1, culturally-sensitive vignettes of desirable and undesirable attachment behavior were constructed, and culturally-relevant descriptors of toddler characteristics were selected. In Study 2, mothers' perceptions of the hypothetical toddlers were compared using the selected descriptors.

The findings indicated that, in keeping with a more individualistic orientation (Ochs & Schieffelin, 1984; Shweder & Bourne, 1984; Whiting & Whiting, 1975), both middle — and lower — class Anglo mothers, compared to the Puerto Rican mothers: (a) placed greater stress on qualities associated with the enhancement of self (e.g., self-confidence, independence, curiosity); and (b) described an active yet related Group B infant as most desirable, and a clingy, distressed Group Cinfant as most undesirable. In contrast, consistent with a more sociocentric orientation (Laura, 1984; Lucca, 1988; Triandis, Marin, Liantsky, & Betancourt, 1984), the Puerto Rican mothers, compared to both groups of Anglo mothers: (a) focused more on qualities associated with the maintenance of proper demeanor (e.g., calmness, respectfulness, obedience); and (b) described as most desirable a quiet, responsive Group B infant whose behavior is tipped more towards proximity-maintenance than towards active exploration, and as most undesirable a highly active, avoidant infant. In short, the Anglo mothers demonstrated a greater concern with qualities which enable a child to cope autonomously in an unfamiliar setting, whereas the Puerto Rican mothers showed a greater concern with qualities which allow a child to maintain dignity and proper demeanor in a public context.

However, because Harwood (1992) used lower-class migrant moth- ers, it remains unknown whether similar cultural differences would also be obtained using mothers living in Puerto Rico. Moreover, given cross-national findings that the middle classes tend to place greater value on personal initiative whereas the lower classes tend to focus more on obedience or conformity to authority (Kohn, 1977; Zigler, Lamb, & Child, 1982), the cross-class stability of these cultural differences remains open to question. The goal of this study therefore was to begin a preliminary investigation into the stability of previous findings of cultural differences in the perceptions of attachment behavior among Puerto Rican and Anglo mothers.

In terms of the study hypotheses, it was predicted that in Puerto Rico the maintenance of proper demeanor is a core cultural value (Crespo, 1986; Laura, 1982; Lucca, 1988) that goes beyond a merely functional relationship between occupational status and the valuing of personal initiative versus conformity to authority. Although some socioeconomic effects were expected in a manner consistent with Kohn's (1977) findings, it was hypothesized that cultural differences in the relative emphasis placed on proper demeanor versus maximiza-
tion of the self would be obtained across socioeconomic status. It was thus anticipated that group differences between Anglo and both middle— and lower—class Puerto Rican mothers on the island would show similar patterns as those obtained in earlier studies between Anglo and lower—class Puerto Rican mothers living on the mainland.

Method

Subject

Twenty-seven mothers (13 middle—class Puerto Rican, 14 lower—class Puerto Rican) participated in the study as paid volunteers. All mothers lived in the metropolitan San Juan area, and had at least one child between the ages of 12 and 24 months, or the age during which the Strange Situation is normally considered appropriate (Ainsworth, Blehar, Waters, & Wall, 1978). Fourteen girls and 13 boys were represented across the two groups (middle—class: 9 girls, 4 boys; lower—class: 5 girls, 9 boys). Covariate analyses by sex were employed to control for group differences in gender distribution. No significant group differences occurred in the age (M = 18.1 months) of the children.

All of the mothers had been born in Puerto Rico, spoke Spanish as their first language, and had lived in Puerto Rico their entire lives. Socioeconomic status was determined using the Hollingshead-Redlich—two-factor scoring system. Among the lower—class mothers, 50% were classified as Level 3 (skilled laborer), 21.4% as Level 4 (semi—skilled laborer), and 28.6% as Level 5 (unskilled laborer). The mean Hollingshead-Redlich score for the lower—class mothers was 26.2 (Level 4). Among the middle—class mothers, 38.5% were classified as Level 1 (major professional status), 61.5% as Level 2 (minor professional status). The mean score for the middle—class mothers was 54 (on the border between Levels 1 and 2).

Mothers within the two groups differed on several demographic dimensions increasingly associated with the lifestyles of professional mothers versus the lifestyles of low—income mothers. In particular, the middle—class compared to the lower—class mothers were: (a) more educated (respective Ms = 16.2, 10.9 years of formal schooling); (b) more likely to be employed outside the home (Ms = 92.3%, 21.4%); (c) older (respective Ms = 31.1, 27.6); and (d) more likely to be married (Ms = 84.6%, 71.4%).

As can be seen in Table 1, these means were generally comparable to the demographic differences obtained between middle— and lower—class Anglo mothers sampled in Harwood (1992), with two exceptions: lower—class Puerto Rican mothers in Puerto Rico were more likely to be married than lower—class Anglo mothers (respective Ms = 71.4%, 46.2%), and middle—class Puerto Rican mothers were more likely to be employed than middle—class Anglo mothers (respective Ms = 92.5%, 75%). In addition, Puerto Rican mothers living on the island had significantly more children and larger household sizes than did Anglo mothers (total number children respective Ms = 2.2, 1.7; total number people in household respective Ms = 4.6, 3.7).

The lower—class Puerto Rican mothers sampled on the island differed significantly from the lower—class migrant mothers in two primary ways: (a) total number children and household size of the migrant mothers resembled that of the Anglo mothers more than that of the Puerto Rican island mothers (respective Ms = 1.9, 3.4), and (b) the migrant mothers were living in greater poverty than were the lower—class island mothers, as evidenced by their lower rate of marriage (27.8%) and employment (11.1%), and a correspondingly low average Hollingshead-Redlich score (16.6, or Level 5). Covariate analyses were done on all demographic variables in order to control for their effects on the study results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristic</th>
<th>Anglo middle</th>
<th>Anglo lower</th>
<th>Puerto Rican middle</th>
<th>Puerto Rican lower (P.R.)</th>
<th>Puerto Rican lower (U.S.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Target Child's Age (Mos)</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>17.7</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>17.9</td>
<td>17.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total No. Children</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total No. People in House</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother's Age</td>
<td>32.3</td>
<td>26.0</td>
<td>31.1</td>
<td>27.6</td>
<td>24.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother's Education (Yrs)</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mothers Employed</td>
<td>75.0%</td>
<td>29.5%</td>
<td>92.5%</td>
<td>21.4%</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mothers Married</td>
<td>97.2%</td>
<td>46.2%</td>
<td>84.6%</td>
<td>71.4%</td>
<td>27.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hollingshead-Redlich</td>
<td>57.3</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>54.0</td>
<td>26.2</td>
<td>16.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Procedure

Mothers performed an abbreviated version of the tasks completed in Harwood (1992) in order to assess their stability among both middle- and lower-class mothers living in Puerto Rico.

Indigenous Conceptualizations

First, consistent with Harwood (1992), mothers were asked two open-ended questions which sought to elicit their indigenous conceptualizations of desirable and undesirable adult behavior by asking what sorts of qualities each mother would (a) like, and (b) not like her own Strange Situation-age child to grow to possess. Together, it was expected that these two questions would provide information regarding mothers’ long-term socialization goals.

Perceptions of a Hypothetical Toddler

Harwood (1998) used both closed and open-ended assessments of six hypothetical 18-month-old toddlers left briefly with an unfamiliar adult in an unfamiliar setting (the waiting room of a doctor’s office). Each vignette was constructed on the basis of Anglo and Puerto Rican mothers’ own conceptualizations of desirable and undesirable attachment behavior, and described each toddler’s behavior during three separate episodes: preparation, separation, and reunion; the vignettes thus sought to simulate the basic characteristics of the Strange Situation.

For the current investigation, just one of these vignettes was used to assess perceptions of toddler behavior among middle- and lower-class Puerto Rican mothers. The vignette chosen was one which had yielded marked cultural differences among mothers in Harwood (1992), and of interest in this study was whether these same cultural differences would obtain among island Puerto Rican mothers across social class.

The selected vignette had been constructed on the basis of middle-class Anglo mothers’ descriptions of desirable Strange Situation behavior (see Harwood, 1992), and depicted active, distal (B1) Group B attachment behavior. Briefly, Harwood found that whereas both mid- and lower-class Anglo mothers perceived this toddler as desirably secure and invoiced in independent exploration of the environment, the lower-class migrant Puerto Rican mothers perceived this toddler to be undesirably hyperactive (intranquil) and lacking in proper respectfulness. (See Appendix for a copy of this vignette).

Open-ended assessment. Mothers looked at a drawing of the setting while the interviewer read the vignette. Following the story, mothers’ open-ended conceptualizations were elicited with the following two questions: (a) “Let’s assume that this child’s behavior in this situation is typical of her usual behavior. How would you describe her personality?” and (b) “Would you like your own child to act this way in a similar situation? Why or why not?

Closed assessments. After mothers’ open-ended conceptualizations were obtained, subjects completed orally two separate ratings tasks:

1) Perceived desirability ratings. In order to provide a quantitative index of perceived desirability of the hypothetical toddler, mothers rated the following statement on a 9-point scale, ranging from extremely no (1) to extremely yes (9): “My own child acts like this in a similar situation” (similarity). To reduce response bias, mothers rated desirability in conjunction with the open-ended questions, and not in conjunction with the culturally-relevant characteristics described below.

In order to minimize literacy and task familiarity effects, mothers were shown a visual representation of a 9-point scale during the ratings tasks, and its significance was explained to them.

2) Ratings of culturally-relevant characteristics. Mothers were asked to rate on the same visual 9-point scale used above how much they thought each of ten culturally-relevant characteristics (selected by Harwood, 1992, on the basis of mothers’ open-ended responses) described the hypothetical toddler. The descriptors were read to the mothers, and ratings were obtained orally.

Interview Administration

The 45-minute oral interview was administered to mothers individually in Spanish by trained Puerto Rican interviewers (graduate students at the University of Puerto Rico) who were naive to the study hypotheses. The Spanish version of the questionnaire was prepared by native speakers of Puerto Rican Spanish, employing back translation.
techniques. All interviews were tape recorded and transcribed verbatim. The sex of the child portrayed in the vignette was matched to the sex of each subject’s a Strange Situation-age child.

Data Coding

Subjects’ open-ended conceptualizations were analyzed at the level of individual word and phrase descriptors into six mutually exclusive categories, which were created by the authors on the basis of mothers responses to questions (1) through (4). These categories consisted of broad domains of behavior described by the mothers, and represented a reworking of the categories first developed by Harwood (1992): (a) Personal Development — concern that the child maximize him or herself as an autonomous unit by becoming self-confident and independent, and developing his or her individual talents and abilities (“to feel essentially worthwhile”, “fend for herself”, “make goals and reach for them”); (b) Self-Control — concern that the child curb negative impulses towards greed, aggression, and egocentrism (“not being disappointed every time she can’t have (what she wants)”, “be violent”, “outgrow selfishness”); (c) Loveliness — concern that the child possess the capacity for emotional warmth, closeness, and affective reciprocity (“friendly”, “affectionate”, “shares”); (d) Proper Demanor — concern that the child demonstrate proper public presentation of self by being well-mannered, obedient, and well-behaved (“not ill-mannered”, “obedient”, “quiet”); (e) Integrity — concern that the child grow up to be a person of worthy character who is hard-working, responsible, and honest (“be working, instead of sitting around like a bum”, “responsibility”, “not to steal”); and (f) Miscellaneous, a sixth category containing all content responses not codeable in the above five categories. In addition, specific types of responses were excluded from the coding because they were vague (“he’s a good kid”), extraneous (“I don’t know that many children”), contextual (“she’s five”), or of a commentary nature (“she’s just picking up from her brother”). It must be emphasized that the first five general content domains were broadly encompassing, and less than 5% of mothers content responses were coded as Miscellaneous.

It must also be noted that responses were coded according to their content domain, and not according to whether they were expressed in positive or negative terms. Thus, the two statements, “I’d like him to be self-confident” in response to question 1, and “I’d hate it if he lacked self-confidence” in response to question 2, were both coded as examples of emphasizing the importance of Personal Development.

Results

The responses of the 27 mothers used in this study were analyzed for comparison purposes in conjunction with the original data collected by Harwood (1992), plus the addition of 11 new mothers in the mainland groups, bringing the total number of mothers sampled on the mainland to 111 (36 Anglo middle-class, 39 Anglo lower-class, and 36 Puerto Rican migrant). Analyses of variance were performed using a mixed design, with subjects nested in culture and class and crossed with the other variables of interest. Post-hoc comparisons of group means were conducted using Tukey tests. Finally, preliminary analyses indicated significant group differences by both culture and social class for total number of descriptors given in response to the open-ended questions (respective means: Anglo middle-class = 68.6, Anglo lower-class = 49.8, Puerto Rican mainland lower-class = 50.5, Puerto Rican middle-class = 46.9, Puerto Rican Island lower-class = 29.5). To control for differential levels of verbal production across the five groups, subsequent analyses therefore focused on the percentages rather than on the frequencies of different types of descriptors generated by mothers.

Open-Ended Conceptualizations

To compare subjects’ open-ended conceptualizations generated in response to questions (1) and (2), a 5 x 6 (Group x Category-Type) repeated measures ANOVA was performed on the relative percentages of each subjects’ descriptors codeable into each of the categories (i.e., of all the responses given by a single mother, the percent of these codeable into each category). This ANOVA yielded a significant main effect for category-type, F(5, 345) = 49.42, p < .01, as well as a significant Group x Category-Type interaction, F(20, 345) = 10.66, p < .01.

As can be seen in Table 2, comparisons of means revealed significant group differences in the percentage of each mothers’ responses codeable into the six categories. In particular, both middle- and lower-
class Anglo mothers were more likely than middle- and lower-class and migrant Puerto Rican mothers to generate responses codeable into the categories of Personal Development (respective means = 55.7%, 40.5%, 32.6%, 23.5%, and 11.0%, p < .05), and less likely to generate responses codeable into the category of Proper Demeanor (respective means = 5.7%, 14.3%, 32.5%, 44.4%, and 56.5%, p < .01)

Table 2. Mean Category Percentages for Mothers' Open-Ended Conceptualizations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Anglo middle</th>
<th>lower</th>
<th>Anglo lower</th>
<th>Anglo migrant</th>
<th>Puerto Rican middle</th>
<th>lower</th>
<th>migrant</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal Development</td>
<td>55.7%</td>
<td>40.5%</td>
<td>32.6%</td>
<td>23.5%</td>
<td>11.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-Control</td>
<td>17.6%</td>
<td>11.9%</td>
<td>7.3%</td>
<td>6.2%</td>
<td>6.7%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likingness</td>
<td>10.7%</td>
<td>10.0%</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td>6.6%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proper Demeanor</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
<td>32.5%</td>
<td>44.4%</td>
<td>56.5%</td>
<td>**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrity</td>
<td>9.5%</td>
<td>22.0%</td>
<td>23.0%</td>
<td>17.9%</td>
<td>18.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Categories in Table 2 do not add up to 100% due to rounding. All p statistics represent all Puerto Rican mothers compared to both Anglo groups. * p < .05, ** p < .01.

Perceptions of Hypothetical Toddler

Open-ended assessments. To control for differential levels of verbal production across the five groups, this analysis focused on the percentages rather than on the frequencies of different descriptors generated by mothers. To compare subjects' open-ended conceptualizations of the hypothetical toddler, a 5 x 5 (Group x Category-Type) repeated measures ANOVA was performed on the relative percentages of subjects' descriptors codeable into each of the categories. (The Integrity category was not used to code the perceptions of the hypothetical toddler, because it rarely occurred in reference to toddler behavior). This ANOVA yield a significant main effect for category-type, F(4, 284) = 86.42, p < .01, as well as a significant Group x Category-Type interaction, F(16, 284) = 9.48, p < .01.

As can be seen in Table 3 and consistent with the study hypothesis, comparisons of means revealed significant cultural differences in mothers descriptions of the hypothetical toddler. In particular, both middle- and lower-class and migrant Puerto Rican mothers were significantly more likely to describe the toddler in terms of the presence or absence of qualities associated with Personal Development (i.e., the toddler was either viewed positively because he/she possessed such qualities, or negatively because he/she lacked them; respective means = 72.0%, 77.6%, 40.9%, 29.4%, and 40.4%, p < .01), and significantly less likely to describe the toddler in terms of the presence or absence of qualities associated with Proper Demeanor (i.e., the toddler was either viewed positively because he/she possessed these qualities or negatively because he/she lacked them; respective means = 7.8%, 11.8%, 48.4%, 62.8%, and 50.5%, p < .01).

Table 3. Mean Category Percentages for Mothers' Open-Ended Conceptualizations of Hypothetical Toddler

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category Usage</th>
<th>Anglo middle</th>
<th>lower</th>
<th>Anglo lower</th>
<th>Anglo migrant</th>
<th>Puerto Rican middle</th>
<th>lower</th>
<th>migrant</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal development</td>
<td>72.0%</td>
<td>77.6%</td>
<td>40.9%</td>
<td>29.4%</td>
<td>40.4%</td>
<td>**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-Control</td>
<td>1.9%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>6.1%</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likingness</td>
<td>17.4%</td>
<td>9.8%</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>5.7%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proper Demeanor</td>
<td>7.8%</td>
<td>11.8%</td>
<td>48.4%</td>
<td>62.8%</td>
<td>50.5%</td>
<td>**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>1.7%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. Categories in Table 3 do not add up to 100% due to rounding. All p statistics represent all Puerto Rican mothers compared to both Anglo groups. * p < .05, ** p < .01.

Toddler desirability. A one-way ANOVA was performed by Group on mothers' ratings of the hypothetical toddler's desirability. This ANOVA yielded a significant main effect for group F(4, 77) = 11.56 p < .01. As anticipated, a comparison of means revealed that, as in Harwood (1992), the middle- and lower-class Anglo mothers, compared to the middle- and lower-class and migrant Puerto Rican mothers, viewed the active, distal B1 toddler as significantly more desirable (respective means = 8.1, 8.2, 6.6, 5.0, and 4.7).

Ratings of culturally-relevant characteristics. To assess the hypothesis
regarding mothers’ perceptions of the hypothetical toddler along the ten culturally-relevant characteristics, a 5 x 10 (Group x Characteristic) repeated measures ANOVA was performed on mothers’ ratings of the toddler. This ANOVA yielded significant main effects for group, $F(4, 73) = 9.72$, $p < .01$, and characteristic, $F(9, 657) = 101.68$, $p < .01$, as well as a significant Group x Characteristic interaction, $F(36, 657) = 4.26$, $p < .01$.

As hypothesized, comparisons of means revealed significant cultural differences in mothers’ ratings of the hypothetical toddler. Consistent with their overall desirability ratings, the Anglo mothers, compared to the Puerto Rican mothers, rated the hypothetical toddler in a significantly more positive direction ($p < .01$) on three of ten characteristics: Calm, Involved with Learning, and Stays out of Trouble (see Table 4).

Table 4. Mothers’ Ratings of Hypothetical Toddler en Selected Characteristics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Anglo middle</th>
<th>lower</th>
<th>Puerto Rican middle</th>
<th>lower</th>
<th>migrant</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Calm</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has a Temper Tantrum</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obedient</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Involved with Learning</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selfish</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poorly Brought Up</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feels Secure about Self</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stays out of Trouble</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affectionate</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. All $p$ statistics represent all Puerto Rican mothers compared to both Anglo groups.

* $p < .05$, ** $p < .01$.

Demographic Characteristics

Analyses of covariance were undertaken across all measures in order to determine the relative contribution to the study results of two child (gender and age) and eight maternal (age, education, marital status, hours worked outside home, total number children, total number people in household, Hollingshead-Redlich score, and income level) characteristics. The analyses revealed that the cultural effects remained significant across all measures when these characteristics were covaried.

Discussion

The findings provide evidence of stability in cultural differences in the perception of what constitutes desirable and undesirable attachment behavior among middle- and lower-class Puerto Rican mothers living in Puerto Rico, as well as lower-class migrant mothers on the mainland. In particular, results indicate that in Puerto Rico the maintenance of proper demeanor is a core cultural value (Gerspo, 1986; Lauria, 1982; Lucca, 1988) that is not reducible to socioeconomic status. Although within-culture socioeconomic effects were found in a manner consistent with Kohn (1977), the sizeable cross-cultural differences obtained in the relative valuation of the maximization of self and proper demeanor are not explainable by socioeconomic status alone.

In terms of mothers’ open-ended conceptualizations, cultural effects were observed in adult socialization goals. In particular, Anglo mothers were more likely than Puerto Rican mothers to describe the maximization of the self as a positive quality. In contrast, Puerto Rican mothers were more likely than Anglo mothers to focus on the importance of maintaining proper demeanor.

Significant cultural differences also emerged in relation to mothers’ perceptions of the hypothetical active, distal B1 toddler. In particular, compared to middle- and lower-class and migrant Puerto Rican mothers and in a manner consistent with Harwood (1992), both middle- and lower-class Anglo mothers rated this hypothetical toddler as more: (a) desirable, and (b) likely to possess four of ten positive characteristics (calm, doesn’t have a temper tantrum if she doesn’t get her own way, involved with learning, and stays out of trouble). In addition, in their open-ended conceptualizations, the Anglo mothers were more likely than the Puerto Rican mothers to describe this toddler as possessing positive qualities associated with the maximization of the self as an
autonomous unit. In contrast, compared to the Anglo mothers, the Puerto Rican mothers were more likely to describe this toddler as displaying qualities associated with a lack of proper demeanor in a public place.

The findings of this study thus provide evidence that Anglo and Puerto Rican mothers interpret Strange Situation behavior differently based on differences in their cultural meaning systems. Although social class effects were obtained in the relative valuing of autonomy and obedience in both cultures, the study results are not explicable on the basis of class alone. Instead, it appears that certain core values are adopted more or less strongly and consistently by both middle- and lower-class mothers in each culture. For the Anglo mothers, this core appears to focus on the self as an autonomous unit: enhancement of the individual’s inner resources and abilities; internal self-control of impulses towards greed, egocentrism, and aggression; and the capacity of the self to engage in relationships characterized by warmth and affective reciprocity. For the Puerto Rican mothers, on the other hand, this core emphasizes the extent to which the individual is interrelated with and interdependent on the larger group.

These differences in core values or meaning systems serve to frame the interpretations given by mothers to the Strange Situation behavior of an active, distal BI toddler. In particular, this child is viewed as positively engaged in independent exploration by the Anglo mothers, but as disrespectful of the setting by the Puerto Rican mothers. Such different interpretations of the same behavior are likely to be associated with different adult responses, and thus with differing socializing activities and routines between adult and child. Further research is needed examining the relationships among meaning systems, interactional routines, Strange Situation behavior, and attachment outcomes before we can arrive at a sensitive cultural analysis of the long-term significance of attachment behavior.

References


Author Notes

This research was made possible through predoctoral grants to the first author from the National Institutes of Health (MH 09911), the National Science Foundation (BNS 8905288), and the Yale Bush Center in Child Development and Social Policy. We would like to thank Joan Miller for her support of this project while the first author was a graduate student and a postdoctoral associate in her laboratory at Yale University. We would also like to express our appreciation to Lourdes Aquino, Angelina Gerena, Melba González, Vickie Lucca, Lydia Rivas, and Elba Velazquez for their generous assistance with interviewing and data coding.

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Robin L. Harwood, University of New Orleans, Psychology Department, New Orleans, LA 70148.

Appendix

This story is about Lee. Lee comes into the waiting room with her
La evaluación cualitativa de programas: conceptualización, modelos y enfoques

DRA. NYDIA LUCAS IRIZARRY

Necesidad de evaluar el quehacer social

Por años se han llevado a cabo un sinnúmero de estudios en Puerto Rico con el propósito de evaluar la efectividad y eficacia de diversos programas de gobierno. Estos estudios en su mayoría tuvieron como finalidad el prover algún tipo de evidencia de que un programa de servicios tuvo los resultados para los que fue diseñado. Como lamentablemente suele suceder, estos informes quedan en el olvido, en ocasiones escasamente se benefician de la luz del día pues quedan sumidos en las tineblas de las gavetas y los archivos y allí encuentran el olvido. Sobre este aspecto nos señala Weiss (1972) lo siguiente:

Once the evaluation is completed, the logical expectation is that decision-makers will use the results to make national decisions about future programming. All too often, however, the results are ignored. With all the money, time, effort, skill, and irritation that went into the acquisition of information, why does it generally have so little impact? (p. 25-26).

El objeto de este trabajo es llamar la atención de la comunidad científica, de la comunidad en general y de los responsables por la administración pública, sobre la importancia de estos trabajos. Consideramos que los estudios que evalúan los programas de servicios de

mother. Her mother sits on the couch. Lee looks around the room and notices the toys. “Would you like a toy?” her mother says as Lee walks over to where the toys are. She picks up a ball and bounces it on the floor. She shows the ball to her mother, smiling and vocalizing. She then picks up another toy and begins pushing it around on the floor near the empty chair, as though it is a car she is pushing along. She makes humming sounds as she does this. She knocks the toy against another toy and makes a crashing sound. She shows the toy to her mother again, smiling and vocalizing.

After another minute, the receptionist says to the mother that the doctor will see her now, and says she’ll keep an eye on Lee for the few minutes that the mother will be gone. The mother says to Lee, “I’ll be right back”, and leaves the room. Lee looks up from her play. She pauses as she watches her mother leave. After a few seconds she selects another toy and continues playing, making humming sounds.

After a few minutes, her mother returns to the waiting room and says, “Hi, Lee”, Lee looks up. She smiles and vocalizes happily, showing her mother the toy she has. She continues with her play until they are ready to leave the office a few minutes later.